

**ANTITRUST LAW,
POLICY AND
PROCEDURE:
Cases, Materials,
Problems**

FIFTH EDITION

2007 Supplement

By

E. Thomas Sullivan

*Senior Vice President and Provost, and
Julius E. Davis Chair in Law
University of Minnesota Law School*

Herbert Hovenkamp

*Ben V. and Dorothy Willie Professor of Law
The University of Iowa College of Law*



ISBN#:1422418197

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc, used under license. Matthew Bender is a registered trademark of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2007 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group.
All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 10¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

Editorial Offices
744 Broad Street, Newark, NJ 07102 (973) 820-2000
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
701 East Water Street, Charlottesville, VA 22902-7587 (434) 972-7600
www.lexis.com

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Chapter 1. INTRODUCTION TO THE COMPETITION MODEL	1
SECTION II. COMMON LAW LEGACIES	1
Chapter 2. FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS	3
SECTION II. THE MARKET IN MOVEMENT	3
SECTION III. JUDICIAL EMPHASIS ON ECONOMIC REASONING	4
D. STRATEGIC BEHAVIOR ANALYSIS	4
Chapter 3. SPECIAL PROBLEMS OF ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT	5
SECTION I. ENFORCEMENT	5
A. TRIPARTITE APPROACH	5
1. Department of Justice	5
b. Criminal Prosecutions	5
2. Federal Trade Commission	6
3. Private Suits	6
a. Jurisdiction, Venue, and Service	7
b. Statute of Limitation	9
c. Interstate Commerce Requirement	10
d. Transnational Application of United States Antitrust Laws	12
e. The Direct Purchaser Requirement and the Problem of Passing On	17
f. Business or Property Requirement	22
g. Antitrust Injury	22
h. Standing to Sue	25
E. SETTLEMENT	26

	Page
F. PRECLUSION EFFECTS OF A PRIOR JUDGMENT ON SUBSEQUENT PRIVATE SUITS	26
H. EXPERT TESTIMONY AFTER <i>DAUBERT</i>	28
SECTION II. ADDITIONAL ANTITRUST DEFENSES	29
A. FIRST AMENDMENT PROTECTIONS	29
1. Overbroad Remedial Orders	29
B. IN PARI DELICTO AND THE UNCLEAN HANDS DOCTRINE	29
SECTION III. REMEDIES	29
A. DAMAGES	29
B. AWARD OF ATTORNEY'S FEES	30
C. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND STRUCTURAL REMEDIES	30
Bibliography and Collateral Readings	31
 Chapter 4. CARTELS AND OTHER JOINT CONDUCT BY COMPETITORS	 33
SECTION I. HORIZONTAL RESTRAINTS	33
A. THE DEVELOPMENT OF ANALYTICAL AND EVIDENTIARY RULES	33
1. Introduction	33
B. PRICE FIXING	33
1. The Foundation Cases	33
2. Supply or Output Restrictions	34
3. Agreements Limiting Price Competition	36
a. Introduction: Fee Schedules	36
4. Data Dissemination and Information Exchanges	36
5. The Meaning and Scope of the Rule of Reason	37
<i>Texaco, Inc. v. Dagher</i> (2006)	37
C. PROOF OF AGREEMENT	45
<i>Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly</i> (2007)	45
Notes and Questions	55
4. Oligopoly Pricing and Facilitating Devices	56

TABLE OF CONTENTS

v

	Page
5. Intra-Enterprise Conspiracy	56
6. Burdens of Proof and Summary Judgment Problems	58
D. MARKET ALLOCATION	64
2. Joint Ventures and Patent Licensing Under Intellectual Property Guidelines	64
3. Horizontal Market Divisions	64
E. BOYCOTTS AND OTHER CONCERTED REFUSALS TO DEAL	64
5. Noncommercial Boycotts	64
Bibliography and Collateral Readings	65
Chapter 5. VERTICAL RESTRICTIONS	67
SECTION I. INTRABRAND DISTRIBUTIONAL RESTRAINTS	67
B. RESALE PRICE MAINTENANCE	67
<i>Leegin Creative Leather Products, Inc. v. PSKS, Inc., dba Kay's Kloset . . . Kay's Shoes (2007)</i>	67
2. Consignment Contracts as a Means to Control Vertical Price	89
4. Vertical Maximum Price Fixing	90
C. TERRITORIAL AND CUSTOMER RESTRAINTS: FROM <i>WHITE MOTOR TO SYLVANIA</i>	91
1. Dual Distribution Systems	92
D. EXCLUSIVE DEALERSHIPS	93
SECTION II. INTERBRAND VERTICAL FORECLOSURE	93
A. EXCLUSIVE DEALING UNDER THE RULE OF REASON	93
B. TYING ARRANGEMENTS	94
2. Development of Unique Per Se Rule for Tying Arrangements	94
3. Proof of Tying Product Power	95
<i>Illinois Tool Works Inc. v. Independent Ink, Inc. (2006)</i>	96
4. Package Licensing and Bundling: Intellectual Property Licenses	105

	Page
Note: The Presumption of Market Power from Patents and Copyrights	106
Chapter 6. MONOPOLY STRUCTURE, POWER AND CONDUCT	113
SECTION II. THE MODERN OFFENSE OF MONOPOLIZATION	113
A. MARKET POWER AND THE RELEVANT MARKET	113
C. MONOPOLY CONDUCT	114
2. The Problem of Strategic Behavior	114
<i>United States v. Dentsply International, Inc.</i> (2005)	117
<i>Verizon Communications, Inc. v. Law Offices of Curtis V. Trinko, LLP</i> (2004)	128
Notes and Questions	136
3. Exclusionary Practices Involving Patents and Other Intellectual Property Rights	142
SECTION III. ATTEMPTS TO MONOPOLIZE AND PREDATORY PRICING	148
B. ATTEMPT TO MONOPOLIZE AND ANTICOMPETITIVE CONDUCT: PREDATORY PRICING	148
2. Identifying the Predatory Price	148
3. Predatory Buying	153
<i>Weyerhaeuser Co. v. Ross-Simmons Hardwood Lumber Co. Inc.</i> (2007)	153
Notes and Questions	159
Chapter 7. MERGERS AND ACQUISITIONS	161
SECTION II. MERGERS OF COMPETITORS	161
B. HORIZONTAL MERGERS UNDER SECTION 7 OF THE CLAYTON ACT AND ITS 1950 AMENDMENTS	161
1. The 1992 Horizontal Merger Guidelines	161
2. Judicial Responses to the Merger Guidelines	162

TABLE OF CONTENTS

vii

	Page
Note: Government Guidelines on Merger Remedies	166
SECTION IV. THE FAILING COMPANY DEFENSE	174
Chapter 8. SECONDARY-LINE DIFFERENTIAL PRICING AND THE ROBINSON-PATMAN ACT	175
SECTION I. INTRODUCTION	175
C. THE TECHNICAL COVERAGE OF THE ROBINSON-PATMAN ACT	175
SECTION III. SECONDARY-LINE DISCRIMINATION	178
A. “PRICE DISCRIMINATION” AND “INJURY TO COMPETITION” UNDER THE ROBINSON- PATMAN ACT	178
<i>Volvo Trucks North America, Inc. v. Reeder-Simco GMC, Inc.</i>	179
Note	186
Chapter 9. ANTITRUST AND OTHER FORMS OF REGULATION	187
SECTION I. ANTITRUST AND AGENCY REGULATION	187
C. JURISDICTIONAL PROBLEMS OF ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT IN REGULATED INDUSTRIES	187
<i>Credit Suisse Securities LLC v. Billing (2007)</i>	187
D. ANTITRUST EXEMPTIONS	201
1. Labor Organizations	201
5. Professional Sports	203
6. National Sovereign Immunity	204
SECTION II. PETITIONS TO THE GOVERNMENT	206
A. Political Process, “Rent Seeking,” and the Antitrust Laws	206
SECTION III. PROBLEMS OF FEDERALISM: PREEMPTION AND THE “STATE ACTION” DOCTRINE	207
1. The Authorization Requirement and the Problem of Local Government Antitrust Liability	207
B. THE “STATE ACTION” DOCTRINE	208

	Page
2. The “Active Supervision” Requirement	209
 Appendix A. ANTITRUST GUIDELINES FOR THE LICENSING OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY A-1	
SECTION 1: INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY PROTECTION AND THE ANTITRUST LAWS A-2	
1.0	A-2
SECTION 2: GENERAL PRINCIPLES A-4	
2.0	A-4
2.1 Standard Antitrust Analysis Applies to Intellectual Property	A-4
2.2 Intellectual Property and Market Power	A-5
2.3 Procompetitive Benefits of Licensing	A-5
SECTION 3: ANTITRUST CONCERNS AND MODES OF ANALYSIS A-8	
3.1 Nature of the Concerns	A-8
3.2 Markets Affected by Licensing Arrangements	A-8
3.2.1 Goods Markets	A-9
3.2.2 Technology Markets	A-9
3.2.3 Research and Development: Innovation Markets	A-11
3.3 Horizontal and Vertical Relationships	A-14
3.4 Framework for Evaluating Licensing Restraints	A-16
SECTION 4: GENERAL PRINCIPLES CONCERNING THE AGENCIES’ EVALUATION OF LICENSING ARRANGEMENTS UNDER THE RULE OF REASON A-19	
4.1 Analysis of Anticompetitive Effects	A-19
4.1.1 Market Structure, Coordination, and Foreclosure	A-19
4.1.2 Licensing Arrangements Involving Exclusivity	A-20
4.2 Efficiencies and Justifications	A-22
4.3 Antitrust “Safety Zone”	A-23
SECTION 5: APPLICATION OF GENERAL PRINCIPLES A-24	
5.0	A-24

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ix

	Page
5.1 Horizontal Restraints	A-24
5.2 Resale Price Maintenance	A-26
5.3 Tying Arrangements	A-26
5.4 Exclusive Dealing	A-27
5.5 Cross-Licensing and Pooling Arrangements	A-28
5.6 Grantbacks	A-30
5.7 Acquisition of Intellectual Property Rights	A-31
SECTION 6: ENFORCEMENT OF INVALID INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS	A-32
 Appendix B. ANTITRUST GUIDELINES FOR COLLABORATIONS AMONG COMPETITORS	
	B-1
PREAMBLE	B-2
SECTION 1: PURPOSE, DEFINITIONS, AND OVERVIEW	B-3
1.1 Purpose and Definitions	B-3
1.2 Overview of Analytical Framework	B-4
1.3 Competitor Collaborations Distinguished from Mergers	B-6
SECTION 2: vGENERAL PRINCIPLES FOR EVALUATING AGREEMENTS AMONG COMPETITORS	B-7
2.1 Potential Procompetitive Benefits	B-7
2.2 Potential Anticompetitive Harms	B-7
2.3 Analysis of the Overall Collaboration and the Agreements of Which It Consists	B-8
2.4 Competitive Effects Are Assessed as of the Time of Possible Harm to Competition	B-8
SECTION 3: ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK FOR EVALUATING AGREEMENTS AMONG COMPETITORS	B-9
3.1 Introduction	B-9
3.2 Agreements Challenged as Per Se Illegal	B-9
3.3 Agreements Analyzed under the Rule of Reason	B-11
3.31 Nature of the Relevant Agreement: Business Purpose, Operation in the Marketplace and Possible Competitive Concerns	B-13
3.31(a) Relevant Agreements that Limit Independent Decision Making or Combine Control or Financial Interests	B-14

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
3.31(b) Relevant Agreements that May Facilitate Collusion	B-16
3.32 Relevant Markets Affected by the Collaboration	B-17
3.32(a) Goods Markets	B-17
3.32(b) Technology Markets	B-17
3.32(c) Research and Development: Innovation Markets	B-18
3.33 Market Shares and Market Concentration	B-18
3.34 Factors Relevant to the Ability and Incentive of the Participants and the Collaboration to Compete	B-19
3.34(a) Exclusivity	B-20
3.34(b) Control over Assets	B-20
3.34(c) Financial Interests in the Collaboration or in Other Participants	B-21
3.34(d) Control of the Collaboration's Competitively Significant Decision Making	B-21
3.34(e) Likelihood of Anticompetitive Information Sharing	B-22
3.34(f) Duration of the Collaboration	B-22
3.35 Entry	B-22
3.36 Identifying Procompetitive Benefits of the Collaboration	B-24
3.36(a) Cognizable Efficiencies Must Be Verifiable and Potentially Procompetitive	B-25
3.36(b) Reasonable Necessity and Less Restrictive Alternatives	B-25
3.37 Overall Competitive Effect	B-26
SECTION 4: ANTITRUST SAFETY ZONES	B-26
4.1 Overview	B-26
4.2 Safety Zone for Competitor Collaborations in General	B-27
4.3 Safety Zone for Research and Development Competition Analyzed in Terms of Innovation Markets	B-28
Appendix	B-28