

APPELLATE COURTS:
STRUCTURES,
FUNCTIONS, PROCESSES
AND PERSONNEL

2009 Supplement
Second Edition

LEXISNEXIS LAW SCHOOL ADVISORY BOARD

Lenni B. Benson

*Professor of Law &
Associate Dean for Professional Development*
New York Law School

Raj Bhala

Rice Distinguished Professor
University of Kansas, School of Law

Charles P. Craver

Freda H. Alverson Professor of Law
The George Washington University Law School

Richard D. Freer

Robert Howell Hall Professor of Law
Emory University School of Law

Craig Joyce

*Andrews Kurth Professor of Law &
Co-Director, Institute for Intellectual Property and Information Law*
University of Houston Law Center

Ellen S. Podgor

*Professor of Law &
Associate Dean of Faculty Development and Electronic Education*
Stetson University College of Law

Paul F. Rothstein

Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center

Robin Wellford Slocum

*Professor of Law & Director,
Legal Research and Writing Program*
Chapman University School of Law

David I. C. Thomson

LP Professor & Director, Lawyering Process Program
University of Denver, Sturm College of Law

APPELLATE COURTS: STRUCTURES, FUNCTIONS, PROCESSES AND PERSONNEL

2009 Supplement

Second Edition

Daniel J. Meador
*James Monroe Professor of Law Emeritus
University of Virginia*

Thomas E. Baker
*Professor of Law
Florida International University*

Joan E. Steinman
*Distinguished Professor of Law
Chicago-Kent College of Law*

ISBN: 978-1-4224-7397-9

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks and Michie is a trademark of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2009 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of the LexisNexis Group.
All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material exceeding fair use, 17 U.S.C. § 107, may be licensed for a fee of 25¢ per page per copy from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

Editorial Offices
121 Chanlon Rd., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800
201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200
www.lexisnexis.com

MATTHEW  BENDER

PREFACE

This supplement brings up to date developments concerning appellate courts, their structures, functions, processes and personnel, since publication of the second edition of the casebook in 2006.

The casebook has had the good fortune and benefit of two thoughtful reviews, which might be helpful background reading for teachers using it. Paul D. Carrington, *A Critical Assessment of the Cultural and Institutional Roles of Appellate Courts*, 9 J. APP. PRAC. & PROCESS 231 (2007); Michael E. Tigar, *A Review of Appellate Courts: Structures, Functions, Processes, and Personnel* (2d ed. LexisNexis 2006), 2 FED. CTS. L. REV. 133 (2007).

Professor Baker would like to thank Gloria Acosta and Marsha Walker for their staff support and Janet Reinke for her skillful librarianship; he is also grateful for the attention to detail of his able research assistants: Chris Kukuruda, Larry Lalla, Jeff Molinaro, and Steve Stavich.

Professor Steinman thanks her administrative assistant Kevin Jones and alumnus David Simon for their contributions to this supplement.

0006

[ST: 1] [ED: m] [REL: 2009s]

Composed: Mon Jun 29 10:30:57 EDT 2009

XPP 8.1C.1 Patch #5 FM000150 nlp 3043 [PW=468pt PD=684pt TW=348pt TD=588pt]

VER: [FM000150-Master:23 Aug 08 10:45][MX-SECNDARY: 25 Jun 09 10:01][TT: 25 Jun 09 10:01 loc=usa unit=03043-fmvsupp01]

0

Table of Contents

Chapter 1	APPEALS AND APPELLATE COURTS: BACKGROUND AND GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS	1
IV.	THE CRISIS OF VOLUME: A PRELIMINARY NOTE	1
VI.	A WORD TO LAW STUDENTS: THIS COURSE AND “REAL WORLD” CONCERNS	3
Chapter 2	APPELLATE REVIEW: WHEN, HOW, WHERE, FOR WHOM, AND FOR WHAT ISSUES	5
I.	CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY BASES OF APPELLATE JURISDICTION	6
II.	MOOTNESS AS A LIMIT ON APPEALABILITY	7
III.	TIMING AND METHODS OF SEEKING REVIEW	8
A.	The Finality Doctrine and Its Permutations	8
1.	Traditional Finality Requirements	8
2.	Partial Final Judgment Under Rule 54(b) and State Law Counterparts	12
3.	The Collateral Order Doctrine	12
a.	Generally	12
b.	Monitoring Trial Court Jurisdiction (orders governing forum selection by stay, dismissal, or remand)	13
c.	Discovery Orders	14
d.	Immunities From Suit	15
B.	Exceptions to the Rule: Interlocutory Review	17
1.	Statutory Exceptions to Finality	17
a.	Categories Specified by Statute or Rule	17
b.	Case-by-Case Discretionary Review	19
2.	Extraordinary Writs	20
C.	Timing Issues Under Governing Rules	22
IV.	SCOPE OF INTERLOCUTORY REVIEW: PENDENT APPELLATE JURISDICTION	25
V.	STANDING TO APPEAL AND THE RIGHT TO DEFEND JUDGMENTS	26
A.	Would-be Appellants	26
VI.	HYPOTHETICAL APPELLATE JURISDICTION	30
VII.	WHERE TO APPEAL	30
VIII.	OTHER ISSUES CONCERNING APPEALS	31
A.	District Court Powers After a Notice of Appeal Has Been Filed	31

Table of Contents

B.	Appeal Bonds	32
C.	Reassignment upon Remand	33

**Chapter 3 APPELLATE REVIEW: BREADTH AND DEPTH OF
REVIEW 35**

I.	SCOPE OF REVIEW	35
C.	Facts Outside the Record	35
D.	Resisting and Deciding “New” Questions and Theories on Appeal . .	39
E.	Plain Error	39
1.	Criminal Appeals	39
2.	Civil Appeals	40
F.	Harmless Error	40
II.	STANDARDS OF REVIEW	44
A.	Distinguishing Questions of Law From Questions of Fact	44
B.	Trial Judge’s Fact-Findings	47
C.	Jury’s Fact-Findings	54
D.	Administrative Agency’s Fact-Findings	55
E.	When Fact and Law are Intertwined	57
F.	Trial Court’s Exercises of Discretion	58
G.	Summarizing Observations for Appellate Counsel	62

Chapter 4 JUDICIAL LAWMAKING 65

I.	LAWMAKING BY INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURTS	67
A.	Overruling	67
II.	JUDICIAL LAWMAKING BY SUPREME COURTS	69
A.	Overruling	69
B.	Recognizing New Causes of Action	70
C.	Judicial Lawmaking in Cases Involving the Application of Statutory and Constitutional Provisions	71
III.	LEGISLATIVE FACTS	71
B.	Appellate Courts’ Use of Research and Empirical Data	71
IV.	MAKING RULES OF PROCEDURE FOR INFERIOR COURTS	72
A.	Formal Rulemaking	72
B.	Supervisory Authority	72

Table of Contents

Chapter 5	THE CRISIS OF VOLUME: PERCEIVED THREATS FROM DOCKET GROWTH	75
Chapter 6	STRUCTURAL RESPONSES TO THE CRISIS IN VOLUME: THE CREATION OF INTERMEDIATE APPELLATE COURTS	83
III.	ALLOCATION OF JURISDICTION BETWEEN INTERMEDIATE COURTS AND THE COURT OF LAST RESORT	83
IV.	DOCTRINAL CONSISTENCY WITHIN THE INTERMEDIATE TIER	83
Chapter 7	PERSONNEL RESPONSES TO THE CRISIS OF VOLUME	87
I.	JUDGES	87
II.	LAW CLERKS	91
Chapter 8	PROCEDURAL RESPONSES TO THE CRISIS OF VOLUME	93
I.	DIFFERENTIATED APPELLATE PROCESSES	93
III.	ORAL ARGUMENT	107
V.	OPINIONS — PUBLISHED AND UNPUBLISHED	107
VI.	APPELLATE ADR	110
Chapter 9	COLLEGIALITY, DELEGATION, AND THE DOCKET DILEMMA REDUX	111
I.	COLLEGIALITY	111
II.	DELEGATION	112
III.	THE DOCKET DILEMMA REDUX	113
Chapter 10	THE CONTEMPORARY ROLE OF APPELLATE COUNSEL	123
I.	INTRODUCTION	123
A.	The Decision Whether to Appeal	123
II.	TECHNIQUES FOR A NEW SETTING	124
B.	Views From the Bar	124
C.	What the Future Holds	125
III.	SUPREME COURT PERSPECTIVES	126
IV.	FRIVOLUS APPEALS AND COUNSEL'S SCREENING ROLE . . .	129

Table of Contents

V.	COURT-APPOINTED COUNSEL IN CRIMINAL APPEALS: THE FRIVOLOUS-MERITLESS DISTINCTION	130
Chapter 11	APPELLATE JUDGES	133
I.	QUALIFICATIONS FOR APPELLATE JUDGES	133
II.	SELECTION OF APPELLATE JUDGES	136
A.	State Appellate Judges	136
B.	Federal Appellate Judges	145
III.	JUDICIAL EDUCATION FOR APPELLATE JUDGES	146
IV.	EVALUATION AND REGULATION OF APPELLATE JUDGES WHILE IN OFFICE	146
Chapter 12	THE SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES	151
I.	JURISDICTION	151
II.	PRACTICES AND PROCEDURES	151
III.	CASE SELECTION	153
C.	The 2000s: Too Few Cases?	153
IV.	SCOTUS — VERSION 2.0	156
Chapter 13	COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES	175
I.	ENGLISH APPELLATE COURTS AND JUDGES	175
B.	The Court of Appeal and Its Judges	175
1.	The Setting	175
2.	The Judges and the Road to the Appellate Bench	175
C.	Criminal Appeals in CACD	176
3.	Conviction Appeals	176
4.	Sentence Appeals	176
a.	Making Sentencing Policy	176
b.	American Developments	177
E.	The Court of Last Resort	178
1.	The House of Lords	178
II.	GERMAN APPELLATE COURTS AND JUDGES	178
B.	The German Court Systems and the Law Applied	178
C.	Appellate Courts in the Ordinary Jurisdiction — Structure and Procedure	178
D.	German Appellate Judges — Backgrounds, Selection, and Education	178
E.	The Federal Constitutional Court (FCC)	179
III.	THE EUROPEAN OVERLAY	179

Table of Contents

A. The European Court of Justice (ECJ) 179

B. The European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) 180

Chapter 14 THE FUTURE OF APPELLATE COURTS 181

I. COURT FUTURISM 181

III. CREATING A NEW APPELLATE TIER 181

A. Identifying and Categorizing Intercircuit Conflicts 181

B. Proposals for a New Court 193

 1. National Court of Appeals (Freund Committee Proposal) 193

 3. Intercircuit Panel (Chief Justice Burger Proposal) 193

IV. APPELLATE SUBJECT-MATTER ORGANIZATION 194

VII. A REFORMER’S MANIFESTO 194

0012

[ST: 1] [ED: m] [REL: 2009s]

Composed: Mon Jun 29 10:30:58 EDT 2009

XPP 8.1C.1 Patch #5 FM000150 nlp 3043 [PW=468pt PD=684pt TW=348pt TD=588pt]

VER: [FM000150-Master:23 Aug 08 10:45][MX-SECNDARY: 25 Jun 09 10:01][TT: 25 Jun 09 10:01 loc=usa unit=03043-fmvsupp01]

0